



**CITY OF ALBANY  
LANDMARKS ADVISORY COMMISSION**

**Municipal Court Chambers  
Wednesday, February 1, 2006  
6:00 p.m.**

**MINUTES**

Members present: Michele Harris, Tom Hinckley, Oscar Hult, Heidi Overman, and Dave Pinyerd

Members absent: Linda Herd and Don Johnson

Staff present: Community Development Planner II Anne Catlin

Others present: Rebecca Bond (Albany Visitors Association), Boyd Moline, Jared and Cara Leach, Jamie Badeau, Steve McNeal, Larry and Judy Christopherson, Tyler Clark, Pam Silbernagel

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 6:04 p.m. by Chair Heidi Overman.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Commissioner Dave Pinyerd moved to approve the December 7 minutes as written. Commissioner Michele Harris seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**HL-01-06:** Request to add three basement level windows to the house at 817 Ferry Street SW.

Chair Heidi Overman asked if any of the Commissioners had site visits or ex parte contacts to report.

Commissioner Oscar Hult reported a site visit.

Planner II Anne Catlin distributed one letter in support of the proposed alteration received from neighbor Beverly Dougherty (attached as Exhibit A) and an email from Commissioner Linda Herd, who supports the proposal, but is out of town this evening (attached as Exhibit B). She then reviewed the exterior alteration review criteria and findings in the staff report. The Landmarks Advisory Commission (LAC) must find that the proposed alteration is compatible with the historic characteristics of the area and with the existing structure in massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural features.

Catlin described the house as a c.1895 Queen Anne Cottage. Decorative features include shingles in the gable ends of the roof and turned porch columns. The house has a basement with existing basement windows on the north side and one on the south side.

The owners propose to add three more basement windows to the south side. The windows would be wood casement windows to match the size and style of the existing casement windows, which look like one-over-one double hung windows. The window trim would match the trim of the existing basement windows.

The proposed new windows will be compatible with the characteristics and details of the house and with the neighborhood. Distinctive or unique features of the house will not be altered or removed with the proposed alteration.

Catlin recommends approving the alteration as submitted, with wood windows and trim.

*Public Testimony*

Owner Jared Leach explained that they had replaced and dug out the foundation in order to increase the amount of living space in the house. The windows are needed to meet egress requirements.

*LAC Deliberation and Decision*

Pinyerd asked if the existing windows were casement windows. Leach confirmed that they are casement windows.

Hult asked why the windows are slightly higher off the ground than the existing windows. Leach said the height was the minimum to meet egress requirements. Catlin confirmed this.

Pinyerd moved to approve the request as submitted. Commissioner Tom Hinckley seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**HL-02-06:** Request to replace two wood windows with vinyl windows at 528 2nd Avenue SW.

Overman asked the LAC to report site visits or *ex parte* contacts. Hult reported a site visit and noted that he is the Monteith Historical Society's president, but that he has no pecuniary interest.

Catlin began the staff report by explaining the review criteria for the use of substitute materials. Substitute materials are only allowed on historic contributing properties under the following conditions: the existing siding, windows, or trim is so deteriorated or damaged that it cannot be repaired and finding materials that would match the original siding, windows, or trim is cost prohibitive.

The application for the use of substitute materials on windows must meet the following guideline: The proposed substitute materials must approximate placement, profile, size, proportion, and general appearance the existing siding, windows, or trim.

Catlin said that the house is a historic-contributing building in the Monteith National Register Historic District. The house was constructed c.1870 and is classified as a Gothic Revival. The east and west portions of the house appear to have been built at different times. The west portion is the older portion and has Classic Revival elements, including six-over-six double hung windows. The Gothic Revival portion of the house on the east side has typical four-over-four double hung windows.

Catlin said she made a site visit to the house. From the street she noticed that most of the windows appear to need repair and new glazing. An estimate for repairing the windows has not been obtained.

Regardless of whether or not the windows can be repaired, the owner would like to replace the wood windows with brown vinyl windows as his budget allows for easier long-term maintenance. He currently wishes to replace a front facing six-over-six original window and a four-over-four window on the east side, both on the second floor and visible from the street.

The vinyl windows are unable to look like true divided lights on the exterior of the glass. The vinyl windows have an internal "grill" to try to match the window designs (six-over-six and four-over-four). The internal grill system, while it makes the windows look like divided light windows, is noticeable, especially when next to existing original windows. The proposed brown colored vinyl would match the current paint color of the windows, but brown may not be the choice of future owners.

If the windows can be repaired, that should be the first course of action. If the windows are extensively damaged, replacement windows should be wood or of a material and design that duplicates the original window as closely as possible, if not cost prohibitive. Catlin said she received a quote for new Douglas fir windows from Ron Johnson. The six-over-six window price was \$295 and the four-over-four price was \$234. Catlin asked Mr.

Moline the price of the vinyl windows. He replied they were \$225 and \$210.

Catlin concluded that new wood windows were not cost prohibitive. She noted that both repairing the windows and replacing the windows with new wood windows would be eligible projects for the matching rehabilitation grant program offered by the City. If awarded grant funding, new wood windows would be less expensive than the vinyl windows.

*Public Testimony*

House owner Boyd Moline sees nothing wrong with the use of plastic windows. The current windows are rotten and being held together with caulking. He feels that 99 percent of the population won't notice that the windows are vinyl. The vinyl windows are also available within two weeks. He added that his wood windows use pins, rather than weights. Moline said he had tried unsuccessfully to get grant money from the City in the past.

Pam Silbernagel, who lives at 540 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue SW, is a member of the Monteith Historical Society. She said the society did not have a chance to hold a board meeting before the public hearing to write a letter from the board. She said that the window muntins are unique in profile with scooped edges. The muntin detail work cannot be duplicated with a vinyl window.

Silbernagel noted that the house was in a prime location in downtown and adjacent to the authentically restored Monteith House Museum. She said the house was in the area eligible for Central Albany Revitalization Area rehabilitation money.

*LAC Deliberation and Decision*

Commissioner Michele Harris asked if the windows could be repaired. She noted that the existing wood windows have lasted for over one hundred years and is doubtful that the vinyl material will last as long.

Catlin assured Mr. Moline that both the LAC and CARA rehabilitation grant programs were new programs last year and that she had not received an application from him. She suggested he might have applied for money from another source. She encouraged Mr. Moline to apply for the LAC grant money, as she feels the project meets the funding criteria. The LAC members agreed.

Overman said she is concerned that the vinyl windows will completely change the character of this unique house.

Hult said he was able to repair windows that he thought were not repairable, that looked as damaged as the ones on Mr. Moline's house.

Hult moved to deny the request for vinyl windows and encouraged Mr. Moline first try to have the windows repaired and, if unsuccessful, to replace them with replica wood windows. Hinckley seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Catlin said she would mail Mr. Moline a copy of the grant application and ask contractor Allen Nelson to look at his windows to determine whether or not they can be repaired.

## PROJECT CONSULTATIONS

519 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue SW. Catlin said that the Christophersons are interested in purchasing this property and would like to find out if they could modify the roofline of the back one-story portion of the house and build a new garage.

Catlin asked the Christophersons to explain modifications they would like to make. Larry Christopherson explained that they would like to combine the different roofs on the back of the house into one roof with a pitch of about 4 over 12. He would like to construct a 30-foot by 30-foot garage with an 8 over 12 pitch. He explained that they would like a storage room above the garage.

Catlin asked if the width of the house was known. The house is 21-feet wide.

The LAC discussed making one roof in the back portion of the house. In general, they would support combining the three roofs over the back one-story portion of the house. The LAC also discussed the size of the garage – both the proposed footprint and the roof pitch. In general, a new garage would be approved, but scale is a concern.

639 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue SE. Owner Tyler Clark received historic review approval for making improvements to this house in the Hackleman district. Since coming to Landmarks, he has decided to restore the two front doors opening to the porch. (One doorway was closed and side lights were added on each side of the front door and the door style doesn't match the house style.) Clark thinks a back door may be original and would like to find front doors to match the back door. He asked if the front doors should be the same design. The LAC confirmed that they should match.

Part of the house rehabilitation project includes repairing and replacing the damaged and T-111 siding. After examining the condition of the original siding, Clark says that there are numerous nail holes from the removed shingles and he is concerned with rust stains. In addition, he's not sure there is enough salvageable siding to do much more than one side of the house. He would like to put Hardie plank siding over the existing siding.

Hinckley explained that you could not install Hardie siding over existing siding, due to the way it has to be installed. It needs to be nailed to the wall studs (2 by 4's) and tar paper is preferred as sheathing material.

There was discussion about where to restore the original siding and where to allow matching Hardie plank. Catlin suggested the LAC allow Hardie plank on the back and west sides, where there is T-111 and the siding is different than on the front. The front and east sides, which are most visible from the streets, would be the original siding.

Catlin suggested that Clark apply for the rehabilitation matching grant to offset some of the costs.

626 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue SW. Owner Jamie Badeau and contractor Steve McNeal were present to get some direction from the LAC on modifications to this small Craftsman style house. A substantial attic fire caused extensive damage to the attic space. They would like to take the opportunity to convert the attic space to living space. In order to get enough height for living space, they propose increasing the roofline by four feet and increasing the roof pitch.

The house has a later addition on the right (west) side with a lower roofline. They have two different proposals from the architectural designer. One shows the proposed roof height extending across the entire width of the house, which is preferred by Badeau. The second shows a lower roof over the addition.

The LAC discussed the two roof modification proposals with Badeau and McNeal. The LAC was supportive of allowing the modified roof to extend across the entire width of the house.

McNeal said they would also like to add a dormer on the back to allow for a bathroom. Catlin asked McNeal to turn in drawings showing the dormer by Friday in order to meet mailing notice deadlines.

**NEXT MEETING DATE**

The next meeting is scheduled for February 15, 2006. Catlin noted that the grant open house will start at 6:30.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 7:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

*Signature on file*

Anne Catlin  
Community Development Planner II

*U:\Community Development\Planning\Historic\2006\minutes\feb 1.doc*