Staff Report

Historic Review of Exterior Alterations

HI-03-20

February 26, 2020

Summary
This staff report evaluates an application for a Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (HI-03-20) to replace the existing hand railing and foundation skiriting along two separate staircase porch areas on a structure located at 1105 1st Avenue (Attachment A).

This structure is situated at the northeast corner of Main Street and First Avenue. The Conn House is listed on the Local Historic Inventory and is located outside of Albany’s National Register Historic District. The primary structure was constructed circa 1893 and is rated historic contributing. According to the Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B) exterior alterations to the original structure include the existing porch, railing and staircase circa 1980.

The applicant has recently received approval for the use of substitute materials to remodel the existing staircase and patio. They are proposing to restore the existing railing and porch skirting to a style that more closely resembles what is shown in the Historic Resources Survey.

Application Information
Review Body: Landmarks Commission (Type III review)
Staff Report Prepared By: Project Planner Tony Mills
Property Owner: Andrea Allen; PO Box 779, Atascadero, CA  93423
Applicant: Marlena Thomas; 1109 NW 9th Avenue, Corvallis, OR  97330
Address/Location 1105 1st Avenue NE, Albany, OR  97321
Map/Tax Lot: Linn County Tax Assessor's Map No.: 11S-03W-06DA; Tax Lot  3700
Zoning: Medium Density Residential (RM) Zone
Total Land Area 4,620 square feet (0.11 acres)
Existing Land Use: Multi-family residence
Neighborhood: Central Albany
Surrounding Zoning: North: Residential Medium Density (RM)
East: Residential Medium Density (RM)
South: Main Street (across 1st Avenue) (MS)
West: Waterfront (across Main Street) (WF)

Surrounding Uses:
North: Single-Family residential
East: Single-family residential
South: Single-family residential
West: Single-family residential

Prior Land Use History: The property was developed prior to land use records. According to the Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B), the residence was constructed circa 1893.

Notice Information
On February 11, 2020 a Notice of Public Hearing was mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the subject property. On February 21, 2020, Notice of Public Hearing was also posted on the subject site. As of the date of this report, no comments have been received by the Community Development Department.

Appeals
Within five days of the landmarks commission’s final decision on this application, the Community Development Director will provide written notice of decision to the applicant and any other parties entitled to notice.

A decision of the landmarks commission may be appealed to the City Council if a person with standing files a Notice of Appeal and associated filing fee with the City within 10 days of the date the City mails the Notice of Decision.

Analysis of Albany Development Code (ADC) Criteria

**Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (ADC 7.100-7.165)**

Section 7.150 of the ADC, Article 7, establishes the following review criteria in **bold** for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations applications. For applications other than for the use of substitute materials, the review body must find that one of the following criteria have been met in order to approve an alteration request.

1. **The proposed alteration will cause the structure to more closely approximate the historical character, appearance or material composition of the original structure than the existing structure; or**

2. **The proposed alteration is compatible with the historic characteristics of the area and with the existing structure in massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural features.**

ADC 7.150 further provides that the review body will use the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards of Rehabilitation as guidelines in determining whether the proposed alteration meets the review criteria.
Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation – (ADC 7.160)

The following standards are to be applied to rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic material or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic material shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The analysis includes findings related to the Exterior Alterations review criteria in ADC 7.150, followed by the evaluation of the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards in ADC 7.160. Staff conclusions are presented after the findings.

Findings of Fact

1.1 Historical Rating. The primary residential structure listed on the Historic Inventory is rated as Historic Contributing but is located outside of a Historic District.

1.2 History and Architectural Style. The historic resources survey (Attachment B) has a circa 1893 date. The Conn House was constructed in the Western Farmhouse architectural style. Decorative features noted on the survey include Eastlake gable peak brackets.
1.3 **Prior Alterations.** The historic resources survey (Attachment B) indicates that the front porch, railing and stairs were altered circa 1980. Records indicate that the survey photo was taken in approximately 1990. Photos provided in the application indicate that since the time of the survey, further alterations to the porch and staircase area have occurred.

1.4 **Historic Character of the Area.** The subject property is located at 1105 1st Avenue, situated at the corner of Main Street and First Avenue within the Residential Medium Density zoning district. The Conn House is listed on the Local Historic Inventory and is located outside of Albany’s National Register Historic District (Attachment B). The abutting properties to the north and east are also situated within the Residential Medium Density zoning district. Properties to the south (across First Avenue) are within the Main Street zoning district and properties to the west (across Main Street) are within the Mixed-Use zoning district.

1.5 **Proposed Exterior Alterations.** The existing structure has two entrances. One entrance is along the southern portion of the structure, visible from First Avenue. The second entrance is along the western portion of the structure facing Main Street. The applicant is proposing to replace the hand railing along the staircases and porches for both entrances with cedar rolls and the foundation skirting with hardiplank.

1.6 **Building Use (ADC 7.160(1)).** The use of the property will remain multi-family residential.

1.7 **Historic Character (ADC 7.160/2).** As proposed, updating the railing, foundation skirting and porch area will preserve and likely enhance the historic character of the property. The Historic Resources Survey indicates that the railings, porch and staircase were altered some time near 1980. A picture in the Historic Resources Survey (circa 1990) shows a railing style and porch area that is different from current photos of the structure. If approved, this project will result in bringing the subject property into greater conformance with the property’s historic character.

1.8 **Historic Record and Building Changes (ADC 7.160(3) and (4)).** No conjectural features or architectural elements from other styles, buildings or time periods are proposed. There are no known changes to the primary structure that have acquired historic significance since the date of the nomination. As such, the proposal is consistent with standards ADC 7.160(3) and (4).

1.9 **Distinctive Features and Character (ADC 7.160/5 and 6).** The building is a two-story Western Farmhouse with Eastlake trim. Decorative features described in the nomination include the following (Attachment B): Eastlake gable peak brackets. The applicant is not proposing to make any changes to the identified distinct features.

1.10 **Guidelines ADC 7.160(7) and (8) are not applicable.** No chemical or physical treatments or soil disturbance of note is proposed. There are no known archaeological resources on the site.

1.11 **Compatibility of Exterior Alterations and Additions (ADC 7.160/9 and 10).** This proposal will not impact any identified features that contribute to the historic character of the property. The existing staircase and porch railing have not been identified as a distinctive feature of the structure. Replacing the existing railing and foundation skirting with a style similar to what is shown in the Historic Resources Survey will bring the structure into better conformance with the original historic features. The proposed alterations are consistent with ADC standards 7.160(9) and (10).

**Conclusions**

1.1 The proposed exterior alterations will replace shingled skirting and an existing deteriorated railing with updated material more closely resembling the original style.

1.2 The proposed exterior alterations will remove no character-defining features.
1.3 By using materials that more closely match the original historic character and appearance of the building, the proposed alteration satisfies the Historic Exterior Review Criteria (ADC 7.150(1)) and is consistent with the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation (ADC 7.160).

1.4 The proposal, as submitted, satisfies the review criteria for exterior alterations.

**Overall Summary**

Staff find that all applicable criteria are satisfied for the proposed request, but also recognize that the landmarks commission may reach a different conclusion.

If the landmarks commission believes the criterion for use of substitute materials has been met, the landmarks commission should approve the request. If the landmarks commission believes the criteria for substitute materials have not been satisfied, the landmarks commission should either apply conditions of approval that would result in the criteria being satisfied, or if that is not possible, the landmarks commission may deny all or portions of the proposed exterior alterations and/or substitute material requests.

**Options and Recommendations**

The landmarks commission has three options with respect to the subject application:

- **Option 1:** Approve the requests in HI-03-20 as proposed.
- **Option 2:** Approve the application with conditions of approval (as suggested or modified); or
- **Option 3:** Deny the application.

Based on the discussion above, staff recommends that the landmarks commission pursue Option 1 and approve the application. If the landmarks commission accepts this recommendation, the following motion is suggested.

**Motion**

_I move to approve the requested exterior alterations and use of substitute materials (application planning file No. HI-03-20) as proposed. This motion is based on the findings and conclusions in the February 26, 2020, staff report and findings in support of the application made by the landmarks commission during deliberations on this matter._

**Attachments**

A. Location Map
B. Historic Resource Survey – 1105 1st Avenue
C. Historic Photograph
D. Existing Porch Photograph
E. Proposed Replacement Porch Door

**Acronyms**

ADC: Albany Development Code
HI: Historic Review File Designation
Page Intentionally Left Blank
1105 1st Ave.

Legend

- **1105 1st Ave.**
- **Albany Parcels**

Date: 2/4/2020     Map Source: City of Albany
OREGON INVENTORY OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES
HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY FORM
COUNTY: LINN

FIELD NO.: 10
HISTORIC NAME: Conn House
COMMON NAME: None
ADDRESS: 1105 First Avenue NE
CITY: Albany
OWNER: George G. Bellamy, P. O. Box 1300, Albany, OR 97321
DATE OF CONSTRUCTION: c. 1893
ORIGINAL USE: Residence
PRESENT USE: Apartment
ARCHITECT: Unknown
BUILDER: Elmer Conn
THEME: 19th Century architecture
STYLE: Western Farmhouse w/Eastlake elements

TAX LOT: 3700
MAP NO: 11-3W-6DA
ADDITION: Hacklemans Third Addition
BLOCK: 3
LOT: 8
QUAD: Albany

BLDG. XXX
STRUC. DSTR.
SITE OBJ.

NO. OF STORIES: 1.5
BASEMENT (Y/N): N
STRUCTURAL FRAME: Wood

PLAN TYPE/SHAPE: L-shaped floor plan (gabled ell)
FOUNDATION MATERIAL: Timber on concrete footings
ROOF FORM & MATERIALS: Cross gables, composition shingles
WALL CONSTRUCTION: Balloon frame

PRIMARY WINDOW TYPE: One-over-one double-hung w/decorative frame moldings
EXTERIOR SURFACING MATERIALS: Shiplap siding, corner boards, medium frieze
DECORATIVE FEATURES: Eastlake gable peak brackets
OTHER: None
CONDITION: GOOD
FAIR XXX
POOR
MOVED
DATE:

EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS (DATED): Front porch post, railing & stairs c. 1980. Rear shed additions
NOTEWORTHY LANDSCAPE FEATURES: None
ASSOCIATED STRUCTURES: Carport
KNOWN ARCHAEOLOGICAL FEATURES: None

SETTING: South facing house on the north side of First Avenue on the corner of First Avenue & Main Street SE. One block south of the railroad tracks.

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (Historical and/or architectural importance, dates, events, persons, contexts): A good example of a Western Farmhouse with Eastlake trim elements on the east side of town. In 1902-05, Elmer & Eva Conn lived here. Mr. Conn was a carpenter and son of Samuel Conn, owner of the Conn & Huston grocery store. The Conn brothers built several houses in Albany during the Victorian era.

SOURCES: City Directories 1905, 1909, 1911-13; Sanborn-Perris fire maps 1895

NEGATIVE NO.: 0-24
SLIDE NO.: 10
ASSIGNED RATING: Secondary
DATE: 07-91

RECORDED BY: R. Keeney
DATE: 03-13-90

SHPO INVENTORY NO: _____
OREGON INVENTORY OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES
HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY FORM - TWO

FIELD NO.: 10
NAME: George G. Bellamy
ADDRESS: 1105 First Avenue NE
QUADRANGLE: Albany

T/R/S: 11S, 3W, 6
MAP NO.: 11-3W-6DA
TAX LOT: 3700

NEGATIVE NO.: 0-24
SLIDE NO.: 10

GRAPHIC & PHOTO SOURCES: Albany Community Development Planning Division & R. Keeney

SHPO INVENTORY NO: ___
OREGON INVENTORY OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES  
HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY FORM  
COUNTY: LINN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIELD NO.:</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>DATE OF CONSTRUCTION:</th>
<th>c. 1893</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HISTORIC NAME:</td>
<td>Conn House</td>
<td>ORIGINAL USE:</td>
<td>Residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMON NAME:</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>PRESENT USE:</td>
<td>Apartment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDRESS:</td>
<td>1105 First Avenue NE</td>
<td>ARCHITECT:</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY:</td>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>THEME:</td>
<td>19th Century architecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OWNER:</td>
<td>George G. Bellamy, P. O. Box 1300, Albany, OR 97321</td>
<td>STYLE:</td>
<td>Western Farmhouse w/Eastlake elements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T/R/S:</td>
<td>115, 3W, 6</td>
<td>TAX LOT:</td>
<td>3700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAP NO:</td>
<td>11-3W-6DA</td>
<td>ADDITION:</td>
<td>Hacklemans Third Addition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLOCK:</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>LOT:</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUAD:</td>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>SITE OBJ.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLDG. XXX</td>
<td></td>
<td>NO. OF STORIES:</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRUC.</td>
<td></td>
<td>BASEMENT (Y/N):</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIST.</td>
<td></td>
<td>STRUCTURAL FRAME:</td>
<td>Wood</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| PLAN TYPE/SHAPE: | L-shaped floor plan (gabled ell) | FOUNDATION MATERIAL: | Timber on concrete footings |
| ROOF FORM & MATERIALS: | Cross gables, composition shingles |
| WALL CONSTRUCTION: | Balloon frame |
| PRIMARY WINDOW TYPE: | One-over-one double-hung w/decorative frame moldings |
| EXTERIOR SURFACING MATERIALS: | Shiplap siding, corner boards, medium frieze |
| DECORATIVE FEATURES: | Eastlake gable peak brackets |
| OTHER: | None |

CONDITION: GOOD FAIR XXX POOR MOVED |

EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS (DATED): Front porch post, railing & stairs c. 1980. Rear shed additions NOTEWORTHY LANDSCAPE FEATURES: None |

ASSOCIATED STRUCTURES: Carport

KNOWN ARCHAEOLOGICAL FEATURES: None

SETTING: South facing house on the north side of First Avenue on the corner of First Avenue & Main Street SE. One block south of the railroad tracks.

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (Historical and/or architectural importance, dates, events, persons, contexts): A good example of a Western Farmhouse with Eastlake trim elements on the east side of town. In 1902-05, Elmer & Eva Conn lived here. Mr. Conn was a carpenter and son of Samuel Conn, owner of the Conn & Huston grocery store. The Conn brothers built several houses in Albany during the Victorian era.

SOURCES: City Directories 1905, 1909, 1911-13; Sanborn-Perris fire maps 1895

NEGATIVE NO.: 0-24
SLIDE NO.: 10
ASSIGNED RATING: Secondary
DATE: 07-91

RECORDED BY: R. Keeney
DATE: 03-13-90

SHPO INVENTORY NO: ___________