Staff Report

Historic Review of Exterior Alterations

HI-19-20

September 30, 2020

Summary
This staff report evaluates an application for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (HI-19-20) to install roof mounted solar panels on a structure located at 1132 Ferry Street (Attachment A).

The subject structure is located on the northwest corner of Ferry Street and 12th Avenue within the Hackleman Monteith zoning district. This unnamed residence was constructed circa 1895 and is rated as contributing within the Monteith National Register Historic District. According to the Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B) exterior alterations to the original structure include: asbestos siding, new windows, skylights, and replaced porch columns.

The applicant is seeking to install 432 square feet of black solar panels with an anti-glare coating within the confines of the existing roof. This proposal will not materially alter the structure.

Application Information
Review Body: Landmarks Commission (Type III review)
Staff Report Prepared By: Project Planner Tony Mills
Property Owner: Ben Thompson; 1132 Ferry Street SW, Albany, OR 97321
Applicant: Hilary Conway, Green Ridge Solar; 19450 SW Mohave Ct., Tualatin, OR 97062
Address/Location 1132 Ferry Street SW, Albany, OR 97321
Map/Tax Lot: Linn County Assessor’s Map No. 11S-03W-07BC; Tax Lot 6200
Zoning: Hackleman Monteith (HM) Zone District, Monteith National Historic District
Total Land Area 4,070 square feet (0.09 acres)
Existing Land Use: Single-family residence
Neighborhood: Central Albany
Surrounding Zoning: North: Hackleman Monteith (HM)
East: Hackleman Monteith (HM) (across Ferry Street)
South: Hackleman Monteith (HM) (across 12th Avenue)
West: Hackleman Monteith (HM)
Surrounding Uses:  
North: Single-Family residential  
East: Single-family residential (across Ferry Street)  
South: Single-family residential (across 12th Avenue)  
West: Single-family residential  

Prior Land Use History: The property was developed prior to land use records. According to the Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B), the residence was constructed circa 1895.  

Notice Information
On September 17, 2020, a Notice of Public Hearing was mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the subject property. On September 30, 2020, Notice of Public Hearing was also posted on the subject site. As of the date of this report, no comments have been received by the Community Development Department.  

Appeals
Within five days of the Landmarks Commission’s final decision on this application, the Community Development Director will provide written notice of decision to the applicant and any other parties entitled to notice.  

A decision of the Landmarks Commission may be appealed to the City Council if a person with standing files a Notice of Appeal and associated filing fee with the City within 10 days of the date the City mails the Notice of Decision.  

Analysis of Albany Development Code (ADC) Criteria

Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (ADC 7.100-7.165)

Section 7.150 of the ADC, Article 7, establishes the following review criteria in bold for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations applications. For applications other than for the use of substitute materials, the review body must find that one of the following criteria have been met in order to approve an alteration request.  

1. The proposed alteration will cause the structure to more closely approximate the historical character, appearance or material composition of the original structure than the existing structure; or  

2. The proposed alteration is compatible with the historic characteristics of the area and with the existing structure in massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural features.  

ADC 7.150 further provides that the review body will use the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards of Rehabilitation as guidelines in determining whether the proposed alteration meets the review criteria.
Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation – (ADC 7.160)

The following standards are to be applied to rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic material or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic material shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The analysis includes findings related to the Exterior Alterations review criteria in ADC 7.150, followed by the evaluation of the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards in ADC 7.160. Staff conclusions are presented after the findings.

Findings of Fact

1.1 Historic Character of the Area. The subject property is located at 1132 Ferry Street, situated on the northwest corner of 12th Avenue and Ferry Street within the Hackleman Monteith zoning district (Attachment A). This unnamed house is rated as contributing within the Monteith National Register Historic District (Attachment B). Most of the surrounding properties are also in the Hackleman Monteith zoning district and within the Monteith National Historic District.
1.2 **Historical Rating.** The primary residential structure listed on the Historic Inventory is rated as Historic Contributing within the Monteith National Historic District.

1.3 **History and Architectural Style.** The historic resources survey (Attachment B) has a circa 1895 construction date. The subject structure was constructed in the Western Farmhouse architectural style. Decorative features noted on the survey include wide frieze and a rectangular bay window on the eastern façade.

1.4 **Prior Alterations.** The historic resources survey (Attachment B) identifies asbestos siding, new windows, skylights, and new porch columns as alterations to the original structure.

1.5 **Proposed Exterior Alterations.** The applicant is proposing roof mounted solar panels on the south and west facing portions of the existing roof (Attachment C.1). The proposed panels will occupy 432 square feet of the 1,532 square foot of roof area. The applicant has indicated that the placement of the panels is necessary to maximize solar exposure. As proposed, the panels will be black and anti-glare.

1.6 **Building Use (ADC 7.160(1)).** The use of the property will remain single-family residential.

1.7 **Historic Character (ADC 7.160(2)).** According to structural drawings, the solar panels will be mounted using P.V. quick mounts (Attachment C.2). The installation will not materially alter the structure or any character defining features.

1.8 **Historic Record and Building Changes (ADC 7.160(3) and (4)).** No conjectural features or architectural elements from other styles, buildings or time periods are proposed. There are no known changes to the primary structure that have acquired historic significance since the date of the nomination. As such, the proposal is consistent with standards ADC 7.160(3) and (4).

1.9 **Distinctive Features and Character (ADC 7.160(5) and (6)).** The dwelling is a two-story western farmhouse. Decorative features described in the nomination include the following (Attachment B): a rectangular bay window on the eastern façade and wide frieze. The applicant is not proposing to make any changes to the identified distinct features.

1.10 **Guidelines ADC 7.160(7) and (8) are not applicable.** No chemical or physical treatments or soil disturbance of note is proposed. There are no known archaeological resources on the site.

1.11 **Compatibility of Exterior Alterations and Additions (ADC 7.160(9) and (10)).** This proposal will not impact any identified features that contribute to the historic character of the property. The proposed alterations are consistent with ADC standards 7.160(9) and (10).

**Conclusions**

1.1 The proposed exterior alterations will remove no character-defining features.

1.2 The proposed exterior alterations could be easily removed by a future owner.

1.3 By minimizing impact to the structure and not altering character defining features, the proposal meets the Historic Exterior Review Criteria (ADC 7.150(1)) and is consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation (ADC 7.160).

1.4 The proposal, as submitted, satisfies the review criteria for exterior alterations.

**Overall Summary**

Staff finds that all applicable criteria are satisfied for the proposed request, but also recognize that the Landmarks Commission may reach a different conclusion.
If the Landmarks Commission believes the criterion for use of substitute materials has been met, the Landmarks Commission should approve the request. If the Landmarks Commission believes the criteria for exterior alterations have not been satisfied, the Landmarks Commission should either apply conditions of approval that would result in the criteria being satisfied, or if that is not possible, the Landmarks Commission may deny all or portions of the proposed exterior alterations and/or substitute material requests.

**Options and Recommendations**
The Landmarks Commission has three options with respect to the subject application:
Option 1: Approve the requests in HI-19-20 as proposed.
Option 2: Approve the application with conditions of approval (as suggested or modified); or
Option 3: Deny the application.
Based on the discussion above, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission pursue Option 1 and approve the application. If the Landmarks Commission accepts this recommendation, the following motion is suggested.

**Motion**

*I move to approve the requested exterior alterations and use of substitute materials (application planning file No. HI-19-20) as proposed. This motion is based on the findings and conclusions in the September 30, 2020, staff report and findings in support of the application made by the Landmarks Commission during deliberations on this matter.*

**Attachments**
A. Location Map
B. Historic Resource Survey – 1132 Ferry Street SW
C. Applicant Submittal
   1. Site Plan
   2. Structural Plan
   3. Applicant Narrative

**Acronyms**
ADC  Albany Development Code
HI   Historic Review File Designation
HM   Hackleman-Monteith Zoning District
Legend
- 1132 Ferry
- Albany Parcels

1132 Ferry St SW
Location / Zoning Map
Date: 9/14/2020     Map Source: City of Albany
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HISTORIC NAME:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMON NAME:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDRESS:</td>
<td>1132 Ferry St. SW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDITIONAL ADDRESS:</td>
<td>NONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY:</td>
<td>Albany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OWNER:</td>
<td>Jimmie &amp; Sandra Roth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATEGORY:</td>
<td>Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCATION:</td>
<td>Monteith Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAP NO:</td>
<td>11S03W07BC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAX LOT:</td>
<td>06200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLOCK:</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOT:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDITION NAME:</td>
<td>Monteith Southern Addition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIN NO:</td>
<td>11S03W07BC06200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZONING:</td>
<td>HM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLAN TYPE/SHAPE:</td>
<td>L-shaped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOUNDATION MAT.:</td>
<td>Brick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROOF FORM/MAT.:</td>
<td>Gable and hipped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRUCTURAL FRAMING:</td>
<td>Wood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRIMARY WINDOW TYPE:</td>
<td>Sliding aluminum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXTERIOR SURFACING MATERIALS:</td>
<td>Asbestos siding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECORATIVE FEATURES:</td>
<td>Rectangular bay front (E), wide frieze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS:</td>
<td>Asbestos siding, new windows, sky lights on roof, porch columns replaced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOTEWORTHY LANDSCAPE FEATURES:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDITIONAL INFO:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERIOR FEATURES:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL INVENTORY NO.:</td>
<td>M.311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHPO INVENTORY NO.:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE FILE NUMBER:</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NAME: Jimmie & Sandra Roth
ADDRESS: 1132 Ferry Ave. S.W.
QUADRANGLE: Albany
T/R/S: T11-R3W-S07
MAP NO.: 11-3W-7BC
TAX LOT: 6200

NEGATIVE NO.: EE-05
SLIDE NO.: MS.311

GRAPHIC & PHOTO SOURCES: Albany Community Development Planning Division & Tanya Neel.
Assessor Parcel File Maintenance

Enter Option: I
Parcel No: 11S03W-07-BC-06200 Account No: 0093100

Status: A Active Retired (Y/N): N

Street Address: 1132 Dir: SW St: FERRY STREET
City: 
Situs Location: 1132 FERRY STREET SW

Legal Desc:
Acres: .00
X-COORD:
Y-COORD:

Tax Rate Area: 310
Assr Use Code: 1011 Assessed/Exempt: A

Pub Owned (Y/N): N

Primary Owner: ROTH, JIMMIE R Phone:
Mailing Addr: ROTH, SANDRA D
1132 FERRY ST SW
ALBANY, OR Zip: 973212527

Contract Owner: Percent/Ownership: .00

*** Press any key to continue ***
1132 Ferry SW
Significance: Compatible
Use: Residence

Present Owner: G. D. Spencer Jr.
Jimmie and Sandra Roth
1132 Ferry SW

Tax Lot: 11-3W-7BC-6200

Description:

Two story wood frame house with gable roof. Has a later single story addition with hip roof and new aluminum windows overall; straight bay on end of original building.
1132 Ferry
Review Criteria Responses:

1. A. There is no change in historic character, appearance, or material composition from the existing structure because the solar system is only on the roof and all materials are removable. The original historic nature of the house will not be altered by the panels being placed on the roof to provide clean energy to the house. The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved, as all of the panels, conduit and other equipment is removable.

B. The proposed alteration does not alter the exterior building. The panels go over the roof and are all black and anti-glare.

C. Unfortunately, the proposed panels are visible from the street because of the orientation of the house, so that the customers can harness the power of the sun for their energy needs.