Staff Report

Historic Review of Exterior Alterations

HI-21-20
October 28, 2020

Summary

This staff report evaluates an application for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (HI-21-20) to replace an existing overhead metal garage door with a wood carriage-style garage door and convert the existing flat roof of the garage into a steep pitched gable roof matching the style and slope of the roof over the house.

The proposed alterations are for a structure located at 724 Lyon Street SW within the Lyon Ellsworth Mixed Use Zoning District and the Monteith National Register Historic District (Attachment A). This Norman Farmhouse style structure was constructed circa 1929 and is rated as contributing within the Monteith National Historic District. According to the Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B) exterior alterations to the original structure include changes to the handrailing on the front porch and replacing the original front windows with tempered glass. Sanborn Fire Insurance maps indicate that an addition to the original house (including the attached garage) was completed sometime between 1925 and 1949 (Attachment C.1 & C.2).

Application Information

Review Body: Landmarks Commission (Type III review)
Staff Report Prepared By: Project Planner Tony Mills
Property Owner/Applicant: Mandi Schwendiman, P.O. Box 311, Tangent, OR 97389
Address/Location: 724 Lyon Street SW, Albany, OR 97321
Map/Tax Lot: Linn County Assessor's Map No. 11S-03W-07BB; Tax Lot 11300
Zoning: Lyon Ellsworth (LE) Mixed-Use Zone District, Monteith National Historic District
Total Land Area: 3,520 square feet (0.081 acres)
Existing Land Use: Acupuncture Clinic
Neighborhood: Central Albany
Surrounding Zoning: North: Lyon-Ellsworth (LE)
East: Lyon-Ellsworth (LE) (across Lyon Street)
South: Lyon-Ellsworth (LE)
West: Lyon-Ellsworth (LE)
Surrounding Uses:
- North: Commercial Vehicle Storage
- East: Multi-family residential (across Lyon Street)
- South: Single-family residential
- West: Single-family residential

Prior Land Use History:
- SP-14-11 Site Plan Review to change the use from a church office to an acupuncture clinic.
- HI-02-11 Replace large tempered glass picture windows in front with multi-light windows per period.

Notice Information
On October 14, 2020, a Notice of Public Hearing was mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the subject property. On October 26, 2020, Notice of Public Hearing was also posted on the subject site. As of the date of this report, no comments have been received by the Community Development Department.

Appeals
Within five days of the Landmarks Commission’s final decision on this application, the Community Development Director will provide written notice of decision to the applicant and any other parties entitled to notice.

A decision of the Landmarks Commission may be appealed to the City Council if a person with standing files a Notice of Appeal and associated filing fee with the City within 10 days of the date the City mails the Notice of Decision.

Analysis of Albany Development Code (ADC) Criteria

Historic Review of Exterior Alterations (ADC 7.100-7.165)

Section 7.150 of the Albany Development Code (ADC), Article 7, establishes the following review criteria in bold for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations applications. For applications other than for the use of substitute materials, the review body must find that one of the following criteria have been met in order to approve an alteration request.

1. The proposed alteration will cause the structure to more closely approximate the historical character, appearance, or material composition of the original structure than the existing structure; or

2. The proposed alteration is compatible with the historic characteristics of the area and with the existing structure in massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural features.

ADC 7.150 further provides that the review body will use the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards of Rehabilitation as guidelines in determining whether the proposed alteration meets the review criteria.
The analysis includes findings related to the Exterior Alterations review criteria in ADC 7.150, followed by the evaluation of the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards in ADC 7.160. Staff conclusions are presented after the findings.

Findings of Fact

1.1 **Historic Character of the Area.** The subject property is located at 724 Lyon Street SW, situated mid-block on the west side of Lyon Street between Seventh Avenue SW and Eighth Avenue SW within the Lyon Ellsworth zoning district (Attachment A) and the Monteith National Register Historic District. This unnamed Norman Farmhouse style structure is rated as contributing within the Monteith National Register Historic District.

1.2 **Historical Rating.** The circa 1929 structure is listed on the Historic Inventory and is rated as Historic Contributing within the Monteith National Register Historic District. Sanborn Fire Insurance maps indicate there was an addition to the original dwelling sometime between 1925 and 1949 (Attachments C.1 and C.2) that included the attached garage.

1.3 **History and Architectural Style.** The historic resources survey (Attachment B) has a circa 1929 construction date. The subject structure was constructed in the Norman Farmhouse architectural style. Decorative features noted on the survey include a steeply pitched gable-winged with Tudor stickwork, large multipaned windows on the façade, a round arch door opening, a round arch window in the porch area, and an exterior chimney.

1.4 **Prior Alterations.** The Historic Resources Survey (Attachment B) identifies the front porch hand railing and large pictured windows as alterations to the structure. According to historic permit data, the windows were restored from the tempered glass found in the survey to multi-light windows in 2011 (HI-02-11). According to applicant submitted materials (Attachment D.3), it is assumed the original garage door was replaced sometime in the 1960s.

1.5 **Proposed Exterior Alterations.**
   a. **Garage Door:** The applicant is proposing to replace the existing overhead metal garage door with a carriage style wood door utilizing vertical grain Douglas fir materials (Attachment D.2).
   b. **Garage Roof:** The applicant is requesting to replace the existing flat garage roof with a steep pitched gable roof to match the existing roof style and slope of the primary structure (Attachment D.1). All new siding and trim are proposed to match the existing cedar siding and wood trim (Attachment D.3).

1.6 **Massing and Scale.** The proposed replacement garage door will not require any changes to the existing garage door frame. Alterations to the garage roof will result in a change to the height of the garage. The peak of the new gable roof is proposed to be 19 feet in height. (Attachment D.1). The existing primary structure is 25 feet in height. The proposed new roof will match the slope of the existing gable roof on the primary structure (Attachment D.1).

1.7 **Materials and Design.**
   a. **Garage Door:** The applicant is proposing to replace an existing overhead metal garage door with a carriage style wood door utilizing vertical grain Douglas fir (Attachment D.2). Based on the estimated construction date of the garage (1925-1949) it is likely the original garage door was made of wood materials. Applicant findings (Attachment D.3) indicate based on
historical use of metal garage doors, the existing door was likely installed sometime during the 1960s. The new garage door will more closely resemble the original materials and style.

b. **Garage Roof:** The proposed alterations to the roof will result in a conversion of the existing flat roof into a steep pitched gable roof. The slope of the proposed roof will match the slope of the existing gable roof over the primary structure (Attachment D.1). Applicant submitted materials indicate the proposed design is consistent with other Norman Farmhouse style structures within the Monteith District (Attachment E). All new siding and trim are proposed to match the existing cedar siding and wood trim on the garage (Attachment D.3).

**Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation – (ADC 7.160)**

The following standards are to be applied to rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic material or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right, shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic material shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

1.8 **Building Use** *(ADC 7.160(1))* The use of the property will remain an acupuncture clinic.
1.9 **Historic Character [ADC 7.160(2)].** The proposed garage door will replace an existing garage metal door. The applicant’s findings (Attachment D.3) identify that historically, metal garage doors were used to replace original wood doors in the 1960s and 70s. The proposed door will utilize a vertical grain Douglas fir material, which is more in conformance with the historic character of the circa 1929 structure. The proposed gable roof will match the slope of the existing gable roof of the house. The applicant has submitted materials identifying similar Norman Farmhouse style structures throughout the Monteith District have garages with matching gable roofs (Attachment D.1). Any new siding or trim will match the existing siding and trim (Attachment D.3). No character defining features will be altered.

1.10 **Historic Record and Building Changes [ADC 7.160(3) and (4)].** No conjectural features or architectural elements from other styles, buildings, or time periods are proposed. There are no known changes to the primary structure that have acquired historic significance since the date of the nomination. As such, the proposal is consistent with standards ADC 7.160(3) and (4).

1.11 **Distinctive Features and Character [ADC 7.160(5) and (6)].** The primary structure is a converted two-story Norman Farmhouse style house. Decorative features described in the nomination include the following (Attachment B): steeply pitched, gable-winged with Tudor stickwork, large multipaned windows on the façade, round arch door opening, round arch window in the porch area, and an exterior chimney.

1.12 **Guidelines ADC 7.160(7) and (8) are not applicable.** No chemical or physical treatments or soil disturbance of note is proposed. There are no known archaeological resources on the site.

1.13 **Compatibility of Exterior Alterations and Additions [ADC 7.160(9) and (10)].** The proposed garage door will utilize materials more consistent with the materials used in the period in which the garage was constructed. The applicant has submitted examples of other Norman Farmhouse style structures that include a gable peak over the garage within the Monteith Historic District (Attachment E).

**Conclusions**

1.1 The proposed exterior alterations will remove no character-defining features.

1.2 The proposed garage door will bring the garage into greater conformance with historic character of the property.

1.3 Alterations to the roof are compatible with the historic character of the Monteith District.

1.4 By minimizing impact to the structure and not altering character defining features, the proposal meets the Historic Exterior Review Criteria [ADC 7.150(1)] and is consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation (ADC 7.160).

1.5 The proposal, as submitted, satisfies the review criteria for exterior alterations.

**Conditions**

*Condition 1 Siding and Trim.* All new siding and trim shall match the style, appearance, and materials of the existing siding and trim.

*Condition 2 Building Permits.* Prior to construction, the applicant shall secure all required building permits.
Overall Conclusion – Conditions of Approval

As proposed and conditioned, the application for Historic Review of Exterior Alterations application to replace an existing garage door and convert a garage roof into a gable roof within the Monteith National Register Historic District satisfies all applicable review criteria as outlined in this report.

**Condition 1**  **Siding and Trim.** All new siding and trim shall match the style, appearance, and materials of the existing siding and trim.

**Condition 2**  **Building Permits.** Prior to construction, the applicant shall secure all required building permits.

Options and Recommendations

The Landmarks Commission has three options with respect to the subject application:

Option 1:    Approve the requests in HI-21-20 as proposed.
Option 2:    Approve the application with conditions of approval (as suggested or modified); or
Option 3:    Deny the application.

Based on the discussion above, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission pursue Option 1 and approve the application. If the Landmarks Commission accepts this recommendation, the following motion is suggested.

**Motion**

I move to approve the requested exterior alterations and use of substitute materials (application planning file No. HI-21-20) as proposed. This motion is based on the findings and conclusions in the October 28, 2020, staff report and findings in support of the application made by the Landmarks Commission during deliberations on this matter.

Attachments

A. Location Map
B. Historic Resource Survey – 724 Lyon Street SW
C. Sanborn Fire Insurance Map
   1. 1925 Map
   2. 1949 Map
D. Applicant Submittal
   1. Elevation Plan
   2. Structural Garage Door Plan
   3. Applicant Findings
E. Other Norman Farmhouse Style Structures

Acronyms

ADC  Albany Development Code
HI  Historic Review File Designation
LE  Lyon-Ellsworth Zoning District
OREGON INVENTORY OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES
HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY - ALBANY
HISTORIC DISTRICT

COUNTY: Linn

HISTORIC NAME: None
COMMON NAME: None
ADDRESS: 724 Lyon St. SW
ADDITIONAL ADDRESS: None
CITY: Albany
OWNER: George & Anne Nicol
CATAGORY: Building
LOCATION Monteleth Historic District
MAP NO: 11S03W07BB
TAX LOT: 11300
BLOCK: 51
LOT N/A
ADDITION NAME: Original Platt
PIN NO: 11S03W07BB11300
ZONING LE

ORIGINAL USE: Residence
CURRENT USE: Residence
CONDITION: Good
INTEGRITY: Good
MOVED? N
DATE OF CONSTRUCTION: c.1929
THEME 20th Century Architecture
STYLE: Norman Farmhouse
ARCHITECT UNKNOWN

DATE OF CONSTRUCTION: c. 1929

OWNER: George & Anne Nicol

ASSESSMENT: N
CURRENT RATING: Historic Contributing

PLAN TYPE/SHAPE: Irregular
FOUNDATION MAT.: Concrete
ROOF FORM/MAT.: Gable
STRUCTURAL FRAMING: Wood
PRIMARY WINDOW TYPE: 8/1 double hung
EXTERIOR SURFACING MATERIALS: Wide shingles
DECORATIVE FEATURES:
Steeply pitched gable wing w/ Tudor stick work (NE), large multipaned windows on front (E) facade, round arch door opening, round arch window (E) porch area, exterior chimney (N)

EXTerior ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS:
None - Brand new on front, 2 large picture windows replaced w/ tempered

NOTeworthy LANDSCAPE FEATURES:
None

ADDITIONAL INFO:
Located on busy commercial street

INTERIOR FEATURES:
None

LOCAL INVENTORY NO.: M.315
SHPO INVENTORY NO.: None
CASE FILE NUMBER: H1-02-11
OREGON INVENTORY OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES
HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY - ALBANY
MONTEITH HISTORIC DISTRICT - PAGE TWO

NAME: George & Anne Nicol
ADDRESS: 724 Lyon Ave. S.W.
QUADRANGLE: Albany

T/R/S: T11-R3W-S07
MAP NO.: 11-3W-7BB
TAX LOT: 11300

NEGATIVE NO.: EE-29
SLIDE NO.: M.315

GRAPHIC & PHOTO SOURCES: Albany Community Development Planning Division & Tanya Neel.
Linn County Tax Data File

Tax lot #........ 11S03W07BB11300
Tax acct #........ 0092177
Site address.... 724 LYON ST S

Owner.......... NICOL, GEORGE P
Address-1..... NICOL, ANNE A
Address-2..... 724 LYON ST S
Address-3..... ALBANY, OR 97321-2921
Address-4.....
Address-5.....

Property class... 1011   Tax Code #1... 0801
Stat class....... 570    Tax Code #2... 0000

Land market value... 16,020
Imp. market value... 67,660
238b. 724 Lyon Street

Significance: Compatible
Use: Residence

Present Owner: George and Anne Nichol
724 Lyon Street
Tax Lot: 11-3W-7BB-11300

Description:

One story wooden structure, Norman style with very steep gabled roof, roof lines facing street. Brick facade on northern extension, wood shingle siding on northern extension. Enclosed garage on southern side, flat roof.
Portland Carriage Doors/Mandi Schwendiman Shop Drawing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Door Style</th>
<th>Sticking</th>
<th>Panel</th>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Glass / Insert</th>
<th>Fire Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MODIFIED, PL24_3</td>
<td>SS</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Douglas Fir (Vertical Grain)</td>
<td>1/4&quot; Clear</td>
<td>Non-rated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Review Criteria Responses:

Proposed Project is within the Monteith District:

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The following standards are to be applied to rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Fact: The current use of the building, medical (acupuncture) clinic, was an approved change from residential in 2011.

Fact: The proposed alteration will not change the current use of the structure.

Fact: The proposed roof modification will preserve the existing garage and stop ongoing water leakage and resultant damage.

Fact: The proposed roof modification is in keeping with other garage roofs in the Monteith Historic district. See photos, attached.

Fact: Metal overhead doors of the type currently installed in the structure did not come into the marketplace until the 1960s.

Fact: The change of garage door from metal overhead door to wood carriage door will restore the building to its historic style.

Conclusion: The proposed garage door change and roof modification will not alter the current approved use of the building or change its defining characteristics.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic material or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Fact: The roof modification and replacement of the garage door will utilize materials matching the existing wood trim, cedar siding and composition roofing materials.

Fact: Carriage style garage doors and gabled garage roofs can be seen on many other properties in the Monteith District attesting to their historic relevance.

Conclusion: The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding
conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Fact: A 1949 update plat shows the garage on the property.

Fact: Gabled garage roofs and carriage garage doors were common on structures of this vintage.

Fact: The metal garage door would have been installed sometime after they became available in the 1960s.

Conclusion: The replacement of the garage door with wood carriage doors will restore the structure historically and not create a false sense of historical development. The modification of the garage roof to a gabled roof will be in keeping with other buildings of the era.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Fact: The gabled garage roof will be similar to other garage roofs of the era.

Fact: The metal overhead garage door will be replaced with historically correct wood carriage doors.

Conclusion: Nothing of historic significance will be altered at result of this proposal.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

Fact: The replacement of the flat garage roof with a gabled roof will preserve the existing garage structure and be constructed of materials and finishes that match the existing construction and detailing.

Fact: The project involves replacing the metal overhead garage door with historically correct wood carriage doors. All existing construction will be preserved.

Conclusion: The distinctive characteristics of the property will be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
Fact: The proposed garage door change simply replaces one door type with an historically correct door type. Any new construction, if required, will match the existing in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and materials.

Conclusion: No deteriorated historic features will be repaired or replaced.

7. **Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic material shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.**

Fact: Cleaning of the structure is not expected to be part of this project but would be limited to spray cleaning of the siding if required.

Conclusion: No harsh cleaning of the structure will be undertaken as part of this project.

8. **Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.**

Fact: This proposed door change is limited to the existing footprint of the structure and does not entail any excavation or removal of earth, concrete paving, or existing surfaces.

Conclusion: No significant archaeological resources will be affected by this project.

9. **New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old, and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.**

Fact: The garage roof replacement will preserve the existing garage wall materials and will be constructed to be compatible with the existing architectural features.

Fact: The garage door replacement will not require destruction of existing materials.

Conclusion: The historic integrity of the property and its environment will be maintained.

10. **New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. [ADC Section 7.160].**

Fact: The proposed door replacement and roof will preserve the integrity of the existing structure.

Conclusion: The historic integrity of the structure will not be impaired by this project.